P/16/1016/FP [O]

MS S SAUNDERS

FAREHAM WEST

AGENT: TOWN PLANNING EXPERT

CONSTRUCTION OF TWO-STOREY DETACHED HOUSE WITH ASSOCIATED LANDSCAPING AND CAR PARKING TO THE REAR OF EXISTING DWELLING

82 THE AVENUE FAREHAM PO14 1PB

Report By

Richard Wright - direct dial 01329 824758

Introduction

This application has been brought to the Planning Committee for determination because the planning agent's partner is an employee of Fareham Borough Council. In accordance therefore with the adopted scheme of officer delegated powers a decision must be made by the Planning Committee.

Site Description

The application site comprises the residential curtilage of a detached chalet bungalow style dwelling located on the northern side of The Avenue, Fareham (A27). The property's northern boundary abuts a verge on the southern side of the turning hammerhead within Chalford Grange, a development of two storey detached houses granted planning permission in 2004.

Access into the site is provided by an existing dropped kerb at its south-western corner on to The Avenue (A27).

A number of mature and maturing trees are to be found close or just beyond the site's western boundary. Two of these trees, a sycamore and a scots pine within the application site are subject of a tree preservation order (TPO). An oak tree within the garden of 14 Chalford Grange to the north of the application site is also subject of a TPO.

Description of Proposal

Permission is sought to construct a two-storey, 3-bedroom detached house in the rear garden of the existing property.

The new house would be located in the north-eastern corner of the site with a small amount of garden space to its immediate south and a larger area (approximately 12 x 9.5 metres in size) to its immediate west. The submitted site plan also shows on the south-western side of the dwelling two car parking spaces and a hard surfaced driveway. Close to the entrance to the new plot would be a further 'visitor' car parking space alongside the entrance driveway which would run between the existing dwelling and the neighbouring flats to the west. The site plan shows three spaces to be retained for use by the occupants of the existing house and turning space for cars or delivery vehicle.

Policies

The following policies apply to this application:

Approved Fareham Borough Core Strategy

CS2 - Housing Provision

CS5 - Transport Strategy and Infrastructure

CS6 - The Development Strategy

CS17 - High Quality Design

Approved SPG/SPD

RCCPS - Residential Car and Cycle Parking Standards Supplementary Planning Document,

Design Guidance Supplementary Planning Document (Dec 2015)

EXD - Fareham Borough Design Guidance Supplementary Planning Document

Development Sites and Policies

DSP2 - Environmental Impact

DSP3 - Impact on living conditions

DSP13 - Nature Conservation

DSP15 - Recreational Disturbance on the Solent Special Protection Areas

Relevant Planning History

The following planning history is relevant:

P/15/0780/FP DEMOLITION OF EXISTING BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION OF

FOUR SEMI-DETACHED HOUSES WITH ASSOCIATED

LANDSCAPING & CAR PARKING

REFUSE 25/11/2015

Representations

Neighbours were consulted on the original application when submitted in October 2016. In response 7 objections were received including one from The Fareham Society.

When the proposal was revised further consultation was carried out in February/March 2017. Five of the seven people who previously wrote in reiterated their concerns and one additional set of comments was received.

The following concerns were raised:

- Insufficient garden sizes proposed
- Harmful to character of area
- Plot size is too small
- Visual effect on Chalford Grange
- Design of house is out of keeping
- Noise nuisance from gravel surfaces
- A number of large trees have been removed
- Impact on remaining trees on the site and adjacent to it
- Too close to/overlooking of/loss of light to neighbouring properties
- Poor outlook from new house northwards
- Highway safety and increased traffic

Consultations

INTERNAL

Trees - There is no arboricultural supporting information with this application to demonstrate the impacts on the existing TPO pine can be managed within minimal and acceptable levels. The layout is acceptable in arboricultural terms.

Contaminated Land - This application could be approved without any conditions relating to land contamination.

Highways - No objection subject to conditions.

Ecologist - Further information should be provided to demonstrate that appropriate species specific assessments have been undertaken at the site since at present this information has not been provided.

Planning Considerations - Key Issues

a) Principle of development

The application site lies within the urban area where the local plan places priority on reusing previously developed land for housing purposes (Core Strategy Policies CS2 & CS6). Whilst garden land in the urban area is not defined as previously developed land it is acknowledged that the redevelopment of such sites can potentially assist in providing housing. The impact of the development must still be considered particularly in relation to the character and appearance of the surrounding area.

b) Character and appearance of surrounding area

On the site is a chalet style bungalow occupying the frontage facing southwards on to The Avenue (A27). Old maps show that in the past the rear garden of 82 The Avenue was more than 80 metres long prior to the development of Chalford Grange within the bottom halves of the rear gardens of nos. 74 - 86. The truncated rear garden of the property is now around 28 metres long from the rear of the existing bungalow and is bound on its northern side by the turning hammerhead of Chalford Grange whilst on its western boundary is a development of flats known as The Limes which was built following the demolition of nos. 84 & 86.

Despite this development the character of this part of The Avenue remains one of large detached dwellings set in reasonable sized plots. This application proposes the introduction of so called 'tandem' development with a dwelling built behind the existing but accessed from the frontage highway. This is out of character with the prevailing pattern of development in the area where there are no other examples in the vicinity.

The resultant plot sizes of both the new and existing dwelling would be appreciably smaller than any others in this part of the road. As a result the development would appear unduly cramped thereby harming the established character and appearance of the area. Views of the new house would be glimpsed through the frontage development and the access through to the rear would be clearly evident. The new house and its plot would be clearly visible when viewed from the surrounding properties including their rear gardens.

The house would however be most prominent when viewed from Chalford Grange. Its position within the streetscene would, to some extent, occupy a gap between 14 Chalford Grange and The Limes. The house would be set forward in its plot close to the northern boundary but with part of its northern elevation tucked behind and very close up to the party boundary fence line with no. 14. This would add to the cramped appearance of the site as

a whole and is further evidence of the constrained plot size being out of character with the surrounding area.

Because of the house's position within the plot the northern elevation would not address the street in the way other houses do up and down the road giving it an unconventional look. The positioning of the main private amenity area of the house to its western side would be different to the rest of the street, however this would be behind a 1.2 metre high post and rail fence with higher hedging behind where a 1.8 metre high close boarded fence currently exists and so not in itself harmful to the appearance of the street.

The proposed development would be harmful to the character and appearance of the surrounding area and is contrary to Policy CS17 of the adopted Fareham Borough Core Strategy and the adopted Fareham Borough Design Guidance (excluding Welborne) SPD.

c) Design

The applicant's architect has taken on board comments from Officers to ensure that the design of the house, in particular its northern elevation, mimics the strong architectural style and use of materials on all houses in Chalford Grange. Notwithstanding the house's cramped appearance on the plot and the resulting harm to the character of the area, the design of the house itself is not objectionable or harmful to the streetscene.

Because of its position tucked behind the party fenceline with 14 Chalford Grange, the outlook from the large ground floor bay window in the north elevation of the new house would be particularly poor being located little more than 1 metre from that fence. This is further evidence of the cramped and constrained site layout.

The main private garden for the new property would be located to the west of the house and would measure approximately 9.8 x 11.5 metres (113 m2). The TPO protected pine tree would stand close by within a landscaping area adjacent the driveway. This tree along with others just beyond the site's western boundary within the grounds of The Limes would have an effect on the amount of sunlight available to the garden later on in the day. Notwithstanding this, Officers consider that the effect of the trees is not significant enough to raise concerns over the amount of useable garden area given the reasonable size of the proposed garden.

d) Effect on living conditions of neighbours

14 Chalford Grange

At its nearest point the new dwelling would be located little over 1 metre from the site's northern boundary at its eastern end which is shared with the adjacent property 14 Chalford Grange. This is again symptomatic of the site's cramped layout. The applicant has attempted to address the issue of overlooking from the first floor window to Bedroom 1 in the northern elevation by using an 'oriel' window with the eastern pane directly facing the neighbouring property to be obscure glazed. However, views would still be afforded from the clear glazed western half of the window into the neighbour's garden at a distance of less than 2 metres. Such an arrangement would clearly be seriously harmful to the privacy enjoyed by the neighbour in their own private garden.

Overlooking from the window in the north elevation serving Bedroom 3 could be overcome by fixing shut the window and using obscure glazing, however that is only possible because

that bedroom has another similar sized window in the western elevation which does not overlook the neighbour's property. Bedroom 1 has no other source of light or outlook than the window in the northern elevation and so could not reasonably be expected to remain shut at all times and be obscure glazed.

The proximity of the new dwelling to the northern boundary, in combination with its height and bulk, would also have an overbearing and significant adverse effect on the enjoyment of the garden of no. 14 as well as the light available to it.

The proposal would harm the living conditions of the occupants of 14 Chalford Grange through loss of light to, outlook from and privacy within the property and is therefore contrary to Policy DSP3 of the adopted Fareham Borough Local Plan Part 2 and the adopted Fareham Borough Design Guidance (excluding Welborne) SPD.

80 The Avenue

The dwelling is also very close to the eastern party boundary with 80 The Avenue. At its closest the new house would be around 900mm from that boundary except for the chimney breast which would be closer. The neighbours living at no. 80 have objected to the application raising a number of concerns including how the new house would adversely affect their property and living conditions.

The new house would be located adjacent to the north-western corner of the rear garden of no. 80. That garden is approximately 23 - 27 metres long whilst the new dwelling proposed to be built alongside the bottom 10 metres of the garden. Whilst the house is two storey in scale and close to the boundary, given the length of the rear garden and the orientation of the house, Officers do not consider the effect would be overbearing such that planning permission should be refused or that there would be a materially harmful loss of light or outlook. The garden at no. 80 has a substantial size TPO protected tree in the centre-east of the rear garden which Officers acknowledge limits the amount of sunlight in certain parts of the garden due to its significant canopy. However this does not change the opinion that the new house would not materially worsen the existing situation to the degree that it would be unacceptable in planning terms.

There are first floor windows proposed to be inserted into the eastern facing elevation of the house. These windows are labeled on the submitted plans to be obscure glazed and could be conditioned to be so as well as fixed shut in the event that planning permission was to be granted.

The Limes

The new house would be sufficient distance from the flats to the west of the site at The Limes so as not to have any material impact in terms of light, outlook or privacy.

The proposed access to the new house would pass close to the east flank of the frontage block of flats at The Limes. However, the proposed layout shows a landscaped buffer between the access and the boundary to distance the comings and goings of vehicles from windows in those flats as well as now proposing a bound hard surface instead of the originally proposed gravel. The new house would not create an excessive number of additional vehicle movements which would adversely effect the living conditions of residents living in those flats.

d) Access

As referred to above, the access through to the rear of the site would be provided via the existing dropped kerb from The Avenue (widened slightly to accommodate two way traffic) and would pass along the western side of the site between the existing house and the frontage flat building at The Limes. The means of access, turning and parking space are considered adequate to serve the development.

e) Trees

The applicant has not provided an arboricultural impact assessment. Although the proposed layout of the site appears to suggest that construction of the house and associated hard surfaced access and parking spaces could potentially be built without harming the protected trees both on- and off-site, no arboricultural evidence has been produced to demonstrate this. In the absence of such information it cannot be concluded that the development would not adversely effect those trees.

f) Ecology

The applicant has not provided information to demonstrate that appropriate species specific assessments have been undertaken. The Council's ecologist has recommended that information be provided in relation to the potential for bats in the existing building and trees on and close to the site, great crested newts and reptiles. In the absence of this information it cannot be concluded that the impacts of the development are known and acceptable.

Had the development been found to be acceptable in all other regards the applicant would have been invited to provide adequate mitigation to offset the 'in combination' effects of residential development on the Solent Special Protection Areas (SPA) so that the development would accord with Policy DSP15 of the adopted Fareham Borough Local Plan Part 2. This would normally take the form of a financial contribution towards the Solent Recreation Mitigation Strategy (SRMS) which is currently set at £181 per new dwelling. Given that the application is not recommended favourably that contribution has not been sought from the applicant in this instance.

The proposal is found to be contrary to Policies DSP13 & DSP15 of the adopted Fareham Borough Local Plan Part 2.

Conclusion

The proposed development would be harmful to the character and appearance of the area and to the living conditions of the neighbours living at 14 Chalford Grange. Insufficient information has been provided in relation to the impact of the development on trees and protected species and no mitigation has been provided to offset the impact of the development on the Solent SPA.

The proposal is found to be contrary to Policies CS5 & CS17 of the adopted Fareham Borough Core Strategy, Policies DSP3, DSP13 & DSP15 of the adopted Fareham Borough Local Plan Part 2: Development Sites and Policies and the adopted Fareham Borough Design Guidance (excluding Welborne) SPD.

Recommendation

REFUSE:

The proposed development is contrary to Policies CS5 & CS17 of the adopted Fareham Borough Core Strategy, Policies DSP3, DSP13 & DSP15 of the adopted Fareham Borough Local Plan Part 2: Development Sites and Policies and the adopted Fareham Borough Design Guidance (excluding Welborne) SPD and is unacceptable in that:

- a) the proposal would lead to the creation of two markedly smaller plots than those typically found along this section of The Avenue and would introduce tandem backland development out of keeping with the prevailing character of the area. The proposed development would appear unduly cramped on this site harmful to the prevailing character and appearance of the surrounding area;
- b) the proposal would give rise to the unacceptable overlooking of the adjoining property 14 Chalford Grange harmful to the privacy of its occupants;
- c) by virtue of its height and proximity to the northern boundary, the proposal would result in an overbearing form of development harmful to the available outlook from and light to the garden of 14 Chalford Grange harmful to the living conditions of its occupants;
- d) insufficient information has been provided to demonstrate that the impact of the development on protected species and habitat is known and acceptable;
- e) insufficient information has been provided to demonstrate that the development would not have unacceptable impacts on protected trees on and near to the site;
- f) in the absence of a financial contribution or a legal agreement to secure such, the proposal would fail to provide satisfactory mitigation of the 'in combination' effects that the proposed net increase in residential units on the site would cause through increased recreational disturbance on the Solent Coastal Special Protection Areas.

Background Papers

P/16/1016/FP

FAREHAM

BOROUGH COUNCIL



